

Relevant findings

Students:

1. Financial Assistance.

For the **Mexicali Campus**, the tendency to provide financial assistance for students to start or continue the Bachelor in Law program has been increasing. In the **January-June 2012** semester, 54 students were given assistance, and in the **August-December 2012** semester, 67 students received the assistance; as well as 62 in the **January-June 2013** semester. Assistance varies from 19% to 100%.

For the **Tijuana Campus**, the number of students and percentage of financial assistance is less. In the **August-December 2012** semester, only one student received 100% financial assistance, **there was no 90% assistance provided**. In the **January-June 2013** there **were no students who received 100% or 90%**, the financial support provided for the majority of the students was of 19% or less.

2. Admission of Candidates.

Mexicali Campus:

3.54% of the candidates scored less than 900 points, the result is: **did not pass**. 22.69% of the total candidates scored between 900 and 1099 points, the result is: **conditioned**.

73.75% of the total candidates scored between 1100 and more than 1201 points, the result is: **passed**.

Tijuana Campus:

1.78% of the candidates scored less than 900 points, the result is: **did not pass**. 30.28% of the total candidates scored between 900 and 1099 points, the result is: **conditioned**.

67.94% of the total candidates scored between 1100 and more than 1201 points, the result is: **passed**.

In Mexicali in 2009 there were no conditioned candidates, but for candidates with a score of 900 to 1099, CEDE follows up and provides workshops, academic and/or psychological guidance as required until the students become regular.

3. Learning Assessment.

In the **Mexicali Campus**, regarding RAPA 2, for the subject **Family and successions law**, the students exceeded the expectations, achieving **“Outstanding” in 76% of the assessed projects; 26% achieved the expected result**, meaning that **100%** of the assessed projects achieved at least the expected outcome.

Regarding RAPA 5 for Obligations, it can be seen that 83% of the projects reached the expected level or exceeded it. However, 16% reached an inferior level.

Regarding RAPA 5 for the subject Alternative methods for the solution of controversies, 75% achieved at least the expected level, but 25% achieved a superior level. However, it cannot be left unnoticed that 25% of the assessed projects did not reach the expected level.

4. EGEL-CENEVAL.

In the Mexicali Campus, in 2011 there were 14 students who took the test, of which 3 (21.4%) achieved outstanding, 5 (35.7%) satisfactory, and 6 (42.9%) without testimony. In 2012 12 students took the test: 7 (58.3%) achieved satisfactory and 5 without testimony (41.7%). There were no outstanding results.

5. Retention and Graduation R.

In 2008, 14 students enrolled in the **Mexicali Campus**, of which 8 are male and 6 are female. Of this generation, we can see that 86% stayed until the fourth year: 75% of the male students (6), 100% of the female students (6). Regarding the generation that started the program in 2009 comprised of 10 students, of which 4 are male and 6 are female, 60% stayed: 3 male (75% of the total males who enrolled), and 3 women (50% of the females who enrolled) a

16 students enrolled in the **Tijuana Campus** in 2009. Of those students, 12 were male and 4 female. Of this generation 50% of the students stayed until the fourth year, 33.33% of the males and 75% of the females. 5 of the students who enrolled in 2009 have graduated and 2 more are still in the program.

Professors:

1. Evaluation.

For the **Mexicali Campus**, the professor evaluations from 2008-2 to 2013-1, have received 74.44 for the first one (lowest score) and 83.88 for the last one (highest score); the minimum expected score has not been reached yet (85). In the **Tijuana Campus**, it can be seen that, even though in 2009-1 the professors received a score of 75.30, in the last four periods (from 2011-2 to 2013-1), they were able to exceed the minimum of 85 and have kept the score above 86. There is an increasing tendency.

2. Placement of resources and academic degrees.

In the **Mexicali Campus**, there is only one full-time professor at the moment. The rest of them are adjunct professors, a total of 19. The average age of the professors is 44.2 years. Average years of professional experience are 17.6. 74% of the professors have master's degrees or higher degrees, while 26% only have bachelor's degrees.

There are 11 professors in the **Tijuana Campus**. Of these 11, one is part-time professor and another full-time professor. The average age of the professors is 43.9 years, and they have in average 19.2 years of professional experience. 73% of the professors have master's degrees and 27% bachelor's degrees.

3. Tutoring and counseling.

In the **Mexicali and Tijuana Campuses**, the academic tutoring program is not being implemented in the Bachelor in Law program, neither the tutoring program because there are not enough full-time professors to carry it out. Even though it is true that **adjunct professors provide tutoring to the students**, they do it in **between their professional and personal activities**, so the students are lacking this support in a continuous way. It would be very significant to have it for better understanding of the subjects.

Curricula

1. Feasibility and sustainability of the program.

Regarding the tendency of the new-enrollment student population for the program, it can be seen that in both campuses the number has increased. In Tijuana and Mexicali (in that order) in 2008 there were 3 and 14 new-enrollment students respectively; in 2009, 16 and 10; in 2010, 5 and 21; in 2012, 18 and 18. However, there is little difference between new-enrollment in 2008 and 2012. For 2013, the goal of 20 (25) was exceeded in both campuses. The Bachelor in Law program has been growing in regards to new-enrollment, as well as retention. If the promotion strategies are combined with other elements such as financial assistance and EDECs, the increasing tendency could be maintained.

2. Structure of the Program

The structure of the program is comprised of three blocks: general education, basic education in law and specific education in international corporate law. The EGEL-CENEVAL test evaluates the level of knowledge and academic skills of the program's graduates in 4 areas: Candidacy and Public Authority (PFP for its acronym in Spanish), Consultancy and Research (CI for its acronym in Spanish), Prosecution of Justice (PJ for its acronym in Spanish) and Administration of Justice (IJ for its acronym in Spanish.) The sub-areas include the main professional activities of each professional environment and the aspects to evaluate identify the necessary skills and knowledge to carry out tasks (case study and legal strategies.) **This involves a focus on practical cases. Our outcomes (Fourth point of the Students section of this summary) show a downward trend in scores in this instrument.**

On the other side, from the instruments applied to students and professors, there is a tendency to recommend an increase to **civil-commercial forensic practice**, which only appears as an optional subject.

The report made by the external reviewer mentions a **“bigger desire for practical legal education”** (p. 2, II,A)

The **learning assessment** let us know that a significant percentage –higher than 80%- is learning at the expected level or higher. 20% of the students showed a learning level lower than expected, which indicates that they are learning what is being taught, but we need to strengthen aspects that involve case study and legal strategies.

Por otra parte de los instrumentos aplicados a estudiantes y profesores existe una tendencia a recomendar que se incremente la **práctica forense civil y mercantil**, la cual actualmente sólo aparece como materia optativa.

3. Content Update.

The **current Structure of the Program** for the Bachelor in Law is from **2006**; however, from **2008** to this date, the Mexican legal system has gone through several **substantial transformations** in: **Human Rights, Procedural Criminal Accusatorial-Adversarial System, Alternative Justice, Oral Trials in Commercial Cases, Labor Law and Appeal Law** (among others), all relevant disciplines for teaching Law.

4. Library.

Specifically for Law, the library has 1 database (Vlex), which is a highly useful tool that allows access to contractual forms of different disciplines, consult laws, legislation,

Executive Summary LDE2006 Self-Study

electronic books and specialized magazines. There are also 8 titles of printed legal magazines, 2820 printed issues, and 65 audiovisual materials. It must be indicated that, even though there are a lot of printed issues for the program, we have found that these are from outdated editions, including laws and other legal ordinance that are constantly being modified.

5. Facilities.

From questionnaires applied to students, we can conclude that they are mostly satisfied with the facilities and resources offered by the institution for their academic, personal and spiritual development. However, there is no infrastructure or space within the Mexicali campus for students to provide legal assistance in an organized and proper way to complete their community service hours. For this reason, we have requested space in different government and private places, even religious associations that allow our students to provide their community service. The disadvantage is that the time and resources are not enough for verification of community service hours provided by students.

The Tijuana campus does not have space to teach the New Criminal Justice System or Accusatorial Procedural Criminal System. The reform for Criminal Procedural cases is in force and its expansion to the rest of the state of Baja California is in process, so the next generations of Law students in Tijuana must strengthen their oral litigation and oral argumentation strategies.

Recommendations

Students

1. Financial Assistance.

The current system of financial assistance for Law students must be socialized, so it can be possible for those students who deserve it and are eligible for them to obtain more support, mainly in the Tijuana Campus. Findings show that there are only a few students who receive some type of financial assistance.

2. Admission of Candidates.

In average, 26.48% of the students at a system level enroll as conditioned. There is need for better follow-up of these students to achieve leveling and better retention results. To the extent in which we are able to increase the academic level of these students, dropping out level will decrease.

3. Learning Assessment.

In average, 20% of the students who were assessed reached lower than expected outcomes, so we need to strengthen the technical aspects so that students can develop their skills and abilities to solve problems related to the subjects chosen for assessment.

The majority of students are reaching the expected outcomes in the assessment, which indicates that they are learning what is being taught in class; however, it is necessary to strengthen the strategy for the students who are reaching lower levels.

4. EGEL-CENEVAL.

This test – as mentioned in its website <http://www.ceneval.edu.mx/> - is focused on evaluating the knowledge and skills necessary for carrying out tasks (case study and legal strategies.) This involves a focus on practical cases. Given the results our students have had in this test, it is necessary to strengthen their preparation to take the test and obtain better scores. A preparation workshop is recommended for this. It would have a duration of 16 hours and focus on case study and legal strategies for the categories evaluated in the test: Candidacy and Public Authority (PFP for its acronym in Spanish), Consultancy and Research (CI for its acronym in Spanish), Prosecution of Justice (PJ for its acronym in Spanish) and Administration of Justice (IJ for its acronym in Spanish.) It should also be considered that, if passing the CENEVAL test will become a mandatory requirement for degree obtainment, a workshop to put in practice everything that has been learned is more than convenient.

5. Retention and Graduation Rate.

As a result of the review, it stands out that attention on the students must be increased in order to achieve that all students who require support, counseling or tutoring are able to receive it by system and not in a circumstantial way. This will strengthen the bond with the student with the Program. Currently, adjunct professors help in some topics of the subject they teach, but are not in the campus for several hours, so the load is focused on full-time professors, which hinders attention to the students.

Professors

1. Evaluation.

It is necessary that professors at a system level receive more training in the use of tools to complement their classes, thus increasing the results of their evaluations, since incorporating technology and innovative tools for teaching will turn their classes into more dynamic sessions.

4. Placement of resources and academic degrees.

The percentage of professors with only bachelor's degrees must be lowered (26.5% at a system level.)

2. Tutoring and counseling.

The Tutoring and Counseling program in Mexicali is not operating. A strategy to start it up must be designed and implemented, considering that there is only one full-time professor and the rest of them are adjunct professors. Offering workshops in different topics that could be considered as difficult, that students find hard to understand, could be an opportunity for them to review and practice the topics; this could be done by a professor or an outstanding student. Another proposal would be to encourage study groups where students could study, analyze, and do homework with the confidence of being among friends, turning it into a pleasant and productive activity.

Curricula

1. Feasibility and sustainability of the program

It is recommended that the promotion strategies for the program are focused on the particularities of what is being offered by CETYS University in the Bachelor in Law program, since they are strengths compared to other schools: Agreement with Escuela Libre de Derecho for exchange, Oral Trials Room replica of the one in the State Government, CONAED program review and certification process. Also, other elements such as socialization of financial assistance and strengthening of EDECs must be combined so that the tendency of the program to grow can be kept.

2. Structure of the Program.

Tendency in the last three years (2011-2013) in the EGEL-CENEVAL test has been downward in the score obtained by the students. The focus of such instrument is the analysis of practical cases and resolution of problems. It is recommended that we create a workshop to reinforce the knowledge acquired by our students who are potential subjects of the test, as well as generating awareness about the importance of preparing for the test. However, from what some students and professors have said, as well as the external reviewer, there is a need to strengthen the practical focus of the program.

3. Content Update.

A revision of the subjects that have been impacted by these changes is recommended to proceed with their update.

4. Library.

There is an acceptable amount of issues in both libraries. An update of the bibliography is required, as well as encouraging the use of databases for research by the students. A substitution of issues, meaning a revision of titles for purchasing is also recommended.

5. Facilities.

Tijuana requires a space for practice related to oral trials and Mexicali requires a space for legal consultancy that operates properly.

Improvement actions

Students

Point number 1 involves establishing a dialogue with the area of financial assistance, as well as CEDE for studying the case and finding prospects that are eligible for greater assistance.

(2014-2)

Points number 2, 3 and 5 of the recommendations depend on starting a tutoring program with a professor or outstanding students, or through study groups.

(2014-2)

Point number 4 depends on starting workshop for CENEVAL preparation.

(2014-1)

Professors

Points 1 and 3 involve gathering the faculty and raising awareness of the importance of the use of technologies for teaching, as well as requesting their support for the tutoring and counseling program.

(First meeting February 2014, 2014-1)

Regarding **point number 2**, professors who have not finished their master's degrees have been invited to continue with the process, and new hiring has been only of professors with master's degrees.

(2014-1 y 2014-2)

Curricula

Point number 1 involves starting up the specialized seminar in Tijuana and in Mexicali so it becomes a permanent agreement with Escuela Libre de Derecho; also, starting up a workshop on oral litigation that allows students to receive instruction on the Procedural Criminal Accusatorial-Adversarial System.

(2014-1 y 2014-2)

Executive Summary LDE2006 Self-Study

Points **2 and 3** require the revision of the most relevant changes that impact the program for its proper update, as well as strengthening the practical aspects in the subjects that are presented only as optional or the introduction of procedural-specialized subjects for the resolution of problems.

(2014-2).

Points 4 and 5 involve economic investment.

(Pending to define)

Final Consideration

1. Re-accreditation of the program.

The Bachelor in Law program from the Mexicali campus will be submitted for re-accreditation by the Accreditation Council for Law Education (CONAED for its acronym in Spanish) in November of 2014.

The program in the Tijuana Campus obtained accreditation in December of 2013.

2. Report of the External Reviewer. Julie Davies, University of the Pacific, McGeorge School of Law.

- i) Focus the program on practice.
- ii) Promote greater interaction of the students with the professors through analysis questions.
- iii) Seek that learning assessment provides greater incentives to the students so that they are more willing to participate
- iv) International Programs: Not only focused on exchange abroad, but incorporate a binational tutoring/counseling program (California-Mexico) in immigration issues.